

August
2007

Gender Budgeting
Experiences from
Tanzania

Edward Hiza Mhina



[Financing for Gender Equality and The Empowerment of Women: Experiences from Tanzania]

Paper on progress made in Tanzania in implementation of Gender responsive Budgeting and proposals for Policy makers on Gender Responsive Budget Initiatives and the Roles of Various Stakeholders.

Paper on Financing for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women: Experiences from Tanzania

Prepared by
Edward H. Mhina¹
Chief Consultant
GAD Consult
[Gender & Development Consultants]

TGNP
Tanzania Gender Networking Programme
Board Member & Committee Chairperson

¹ The consultant once worked as a researcher for TGNP in studying resource allocation from a gender perspective in the Ministry of Education & Culture, as well as the Ministry of Higher Education, Science & Technology. The exercise produced several reports and papers. TGNP has through such work produced a book titled **“Gender Analysis on Budgets in Tanzania”**. “Manual on Rural Accessibility Planning” since October 1997. This experience exposed him to the planning related details as regards rural accessibility issues in terms of access and mobility matters. Another paper on TGNP’s experiences with collaboration in gender budgeting was presented by the consultant at the University of London in July 1999.

Additional exposure to gender budgeting activities was gained in relation to the UNIFEM’s regional office’s bi-annual meetings in Harare, Zimbabwe (which was a platform for sharing on progress within gender budgeting in the region). The consultant was engaged as a researcher to share in new findings and observations within GBI in Tanzania.

Moreover, the consultant was also involved as a consultant in gender budgeting exercises in the following areas within and without Tanzania: Presentation of research paper titled **“Tanzanian Experiences on NGO and Government Research Partnership in Gender Budgeting”** (April 2000), at the Commonwealth Secretariat in London UK (May 2000). In April 2003, the consultant prepared and executed an in-country workshop on **“Gender Budget Analysis for Poverty Reduction”**, for more than 70 participants from the Ministry of Finance, Planning & Economic Development in Uganda. In the last 3 years, the consultant has written 3 other papers on engendering financial reforms and the accountant general offices, for the Association of East and Southern African Accountant Generals - ESAAG.

ACRONYMS

AIDS	Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
BPFA	Beijing Platform for Action (1995)
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination Against Women
CSO	Civil Society Organizations
CSW	Commission on the Status of Women
CVO	Community Voluntary Organization
FAWE	Forum for African Women Educationists
FGC	Female Genital Cutting
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
GAD	Gender and Development
GB	Gender Budgets
GFP	Gender Focal Person(s)
GM	Gender Mainstreaming
GMWG-MP	Gender Mainstreaming Working Group- Macro Policies
GRB	Gender Responsive Budgets
HIV	Human Immuno Deficiency Virus
IMF	International Monetary Fund
OD	Organizational Development
PER/ MTEF	Public Expenditure Review/ Mid-Term Expenditure Framework
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
MCDGC	Ministry of Community Development, Gender and Children
MDG	Millennium Development Goals
TGNP	Tanzania Gender Networking Program
TOR	Terms of Reference
SADC	Southern African Development Cooperation
SAP	Structural Adjustment Program
SME	Small Medium Enterprises
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UNDP	UN Development Programme
UNICEF	UN Children's Fund
UNIFEM	UN Development Fund for Women
WB	World Bank
WO	Women's Organization
VAW	Violence Against Women
QMR	Quarterly Monitoring Reports

PREAMBLE

Between 1997 and 1999, Tanzania Gender Networking Programme (TGNP), an NGO based in Tanzania, has been engaged in researching how the Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Education & Culture, Ministry of Science, Technology & Higher Education, Ministry of Agriculture & Cooperatives, Ministry of Health and The President's Office, Planning Commission, and the Ministry of Industries and Trade, allocate resources to men and women in the Tanzanian communities through budgetary processes. This "TGNP Gender Budgeting Initiative" participatory action research is part of TGNP's endeavour to trace gender gaps within the budgeting process and procedures, and therefore address these by means of lobbying and advocacy.

It is a fact that gender responsive budgets provide a means for determining the effect of government revenue and expenditure policies on women and men. GRB initiatives consist of different components and vary considerably across countries and regions. These initiatives are led either by governments or civil society groups, or a combination thereof. They mainly involve the examination of how budgetary allocations affect economic and social opportunities for women and men. To date, GRB initiatives have been implemented in more than 40 countries world wide. The nature of GRB initiatives varies from country to country.

The main focus in this paper is on: gender responsive budgeting initiatives in Tanzania; achievements so far in addressing gender responsive initiatives in government and other public development activities; the role of various stakeholders in such initiatives; and the impact of such initiatives in increasing resources for gender equality. This paper is created from the personal experiences of the writer as one of the researchers, as a full member of TGNP, a TGNP Board Member, and as an active and committed protagonist of gender equality and equity within the local and global development contexts.

Quite a handful of people assisted and facilitated in different ways in making this paper and its composition successful. I should thus convey my gratitude to the staff the GAD Consult **Ms. Khalila A. Shariff, Ms. Zainab Abdallah, and Ms. Farida Katuli** for their research in enabling me accomplish this engagement, and, **Ms. Asha Sarota**, the from Ministry of Community Development, Gender & Children Development. It is my sincere belief that support from all the above mentioned people, and many others, enabled me accomplish this paper comfortably.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Since budgets are concerned with distribution of resources, goods, services and obligations to members of a community, it is crucial to go beyond and see how these revenues and expenditures are actually beneficial to the male and female members of the respective community.

Gender budgets enable a scrutiny on whether the delivered services and income transfers actually support meeting policies on creation of gender equality and equity across all sectors. In other words, gender budgeting assists governments get a better perspective on how budgets should adjust or reallocate resources to effectively address priorities defined by the male and female members of community. Moreover, gender budgeting challenges traditional planning processes and opens them up into being more participatory, democratic and increasingly accountable.

Assuming that the GBI exercise is a long term gender transformation strategy with immediate and sometimes short term goals, it is anticipated its presence will be indefinite. As of present, actors within the Tanzanian gender budgeting initiatives scenario need to concentrate their efforts in the following areas:

- Standardisation and popularisation of tools used in gender disaggregated beneficiary assessment of service delivery and budget priorities in the piloted MDAs.
- Annual follow-up and scrutiny of gender aware medium term macroeconomic policy

framework [MTEF] through the PER and TAS forums.

- Yearly review of gender aware policy evaluation of public expenditures with the Ministry of Finance through the Ministry's programme performance budgeting system.
- Regularised scrutiny of gender aware budget statements, especially in women's priority public services such as health and within education, policy making and legislation.
- Engaging additional research on gender disaggregated public expenditure benefit incidence analysis at the local government level within TGNP's IGN networks Districts.
- Producing annual reports on achievements and technical progress in gender budgeting interventions in collaboration with the Ministry of Finance and or Planning Commission.
- Inserting gender budgeting as a component in capacity or skills building courses, seminars or workshops at finance institutions such as: Institute of Finance Management [IFM], and College of Business Administration [CBA], and the Faculty of Commerce and Management [FCM]; planning institutions such as: Institute of Development Planning and Institute of Rural Development Planning; and for donor funded activities within Tanzania in making GRB as part of the agenda in evaluations, assessments and reviews.

INTRODUCTION²

For the past 10 years, the Government of Tanzania (GoT) has engaged various efforts in collaboration with the Tanzania Gender Networking Programme - TGNP, towards engendering of financing for development in selected sectors. Taking off from the TGNP initiated Gender Budgeting Research in 5 government ministries (e.g., Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Education & Culture, Ministry of Science, Technology & Higher Education, Ministry of Health and The President's Office, Planning Commission - all in 1998; Ministry of Agriculture & Cooperatives (in 1999; and the Ministry of Industries and Trade - covered in the year 2000). The government of Tanzania quickly followed up with a pilot programme to establishing gender budgeting in 6 selected ministries, with varying results. The 1997 TGNP & GoT initiated GBI research creating a baseline on resource distribution in key ministries from a gender perspective.

PROGRESS IN TANZANIA AS REGARDS GENDER RESPONSIVE BUDGETS

There is ample evidence as regards steady progress in gender budgeting in Tanzania. Not only are the country's experiences widely quoted in many sources, but the government-NGO collaboration approach is widely acclaimed as innovative and ground breaking. After initial efforts in advocating for gender mainstreaming in government interventions hitting a deaf ear, TGNP discovered that it is more effective changing tactics through

² This paper does not give an official version of the TGNP or Government agencies involved in the GBI Action Research Project, instead it is created from the personal experiences of the writer as one of the researchers, as a full member of TGNP, and as an active and committed protagonist of gender equality and equity within the local and global development contexts.

acquiring a partnership based team approach. Success in this approach has been exemplary in regards to the fact that in the year 2000, the government of Tanzania took the obligation of appointing 6 ministries (Ministry of Health; Ministry of Education & Culture; Ministry of Agriculture & Food Security; Ministry of Water; Ministry of Regional Administration & Local Governments; Ministry for Community Development, Gender & Children Development; and Ministry of Finance), for piloting institutionalisation of the GRB exercise through own funding and support from SIDA and the Netherlands.

Focus in the pilot ministries centred on: conduction of training for budget officers; backstopping the budget officers in preparation of their sector budgets; and, development of gender budgeting checklist and mainstreaming tools for enabling the engendering process. Not all ministries managed to effectively capitalise on TGNP services, except for the Ministry of Water. Nevertheless, all pilot ministries continued addressing gender issues with numerous variations. The main steps in implementing the GBI process are briefly summarized below:

- Action-oriented research activities were conducted at the national level (Ministries) and district level (related sectors at the district level). These sectors included: the Planning Commission and Treasury, as the key sectors in the planning and budgeting process, Health, Education, Agriculture and Industry and Commerce.
- Data was collected and analysed with a gender focus. A team of resource persons from the government sector the academia and civil society took part in the exercise.
- Development of tools and capacity building on gender issues have and are continuously taking place by TGNP, FEMACT, NGO's and CBO's as well as for allies and key actors in government Ministries, focusing on participatory planning and budgeting.
- A popular booklet titled "**Budgeting with a Gender Focus**" has been published and disseminated while lobbying strategies and other tools for parliamentary and public lobbying have been developed.
- Contacts with individual women and men MP's and key Parliamentary Committees such as Finance and Economics Committee

members were established, and lobbying activities conducted.

Focus of the second phase of the GRB exercise in Tanzania was mainly in regards to:

- Equitable access to and control over national and international resources through effective empowerment on critical issues affecting people's lives.
- Breaking the silence on linkages between gender, resources & HIV/AIDS by questioning and seeking redress in the unequal ownership or control of resources.
- Alternative approaches to development & Democracy by challenging the prevailing neo-liberal discourse.
- Participatory democracy through active people and community engagement in control and use of resources.
- Government responsibility for social provision of public goods in regards to information generation and dissemination as concerns access to ARVs and PMTCT services.
- Easing burdens by eliminating oppressive traditional myths and beliefs in care for the sick.
- Engaging with government on policy issues so as to create a national debate on accountability and representativeness.
- Transforming social and public policies in eradication of user fees and improvement of public service facilities.
- Capacity development of core task teams, and broad based actors as regards conceptual clarity.
- Action and Advocacy in countering oppressive trade policies, HIPC mechanisms & conditionality, and the creation of a true consultative process.
- Engaging with Parliamentarians in Finance & Economic Committee, Sub-Committees, Chairpersons, MPs, through sharing of position papers.
- Engaging with selected LGAs in Kinondoni, Kisarawe, Kondoa, Songea Rural, Kilosa, Sumbawanga, IGNs in Zanzibar, Mtwara, Lindi, in establishing intermediary gender networks.

IMPACT, GAPS AND CHALLENGES IN GRB

Main **achievements or impact** in the GBI process in the **first phase** were particularly in the following areas:

- Identification of structural and social constraints as regards inadequate civil society involvement or consultation.
- Addressing capacity requirements in analytical and conceptual understanding of gender mainstreaming in resource management.
- Access to government decision making structures, bodies and MDA leadership through the PER, TAS and PRSP processes.
- Enhanced questioning of macro economic processes on gender sensitivity, especially on pro-poor equity issues and on linkages between gender and economics.
- NGO coalition through FemAct Coalition and media, and at sub-national level through IGNs and GDSS.
- Trust building with Ministries especially those in Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Economic Planning & Empowerment, Ministry of Community Development, Gender & Children Development, Commission, etc.
- Creation of pilot sectors for institutionalising gender mainstreaming and budgeting interventions in Health, Education, Agriculture, Water, Community Development and Local Government.

Additional **achievements or impact** registered so far in the **second phase** of the GBI campaign are the hereunder:

- Government recognition and commitment regularly reflected in budget speeches such as the President's Office Ministry of Planning & Privatization, which stated strengthened resolve on gender mainstreaming in planning and budget processes.
- Increased openness and transparency in the government budget processes, through wide sharing of PRS2 process leading to creation of the MKUKUTA [NSGRP], creation of a national website and wider media access.
- Adoption and reflection of NSGRP strategies by all ministries departments and agencies through embedding these in their sectoral goals, outcomes and targets.
- Inclusion of pro-poor and gender equity suggestions in the water sector budget

guidelines, allocations to health and water sectors, and in the water sector PER study.

- Acceptance and recognition of CSOs-TGNP membership in PER process, Gender Macro Group, PER Water WG, PRSP Review Process, as well as the Poverty Policy Week;
- Policy Briefs & Analysis in reports on macro policies and processes.
- Coalition building & Networking in 4 collective actions on: Land Act - 7 CSOs, PRS Review - 50 outreach groups & 40 FemAct organisations, 50 GDSS, 6047 people, 12 IGNs, 50 Outreach groups, 40 FemAct NGOS.
- Public review of 2004/05, 2005/06 and 2006/07 Budgets from a pro-poor and gender equity focus.
- Policy dialogue in alternative views shared through the PER budget sessions, meetings with parliamentary committees, Finance, Trade & Investment, and the Parliamentary Women's Group.
- Policy Engagement in 72 key sessions with government, CG, PER, PRSP 2 or NSGRP.

Results of Phase I and II indicate that TGNP has managed to influence the budget guidelines to incorporate gender issues. For example, according to paragraphs 3.12 and 3.13 in the **"Guidelines for the Preparation of The Medium Term Plan and Expenditure Framework for 2000/01-2002/3"**, issued by the Planning Commission, the government directed its accounting officers in the ministries of: Community Development, Women Affairs and Children; Education and Culture; Health; Water, Energy and Minerals; Regional Administration and Local Government; who plan through the MTEF, to take consideration of the following gender budgeting aspects:

- Capacity building in gender analysis in projects and programmes.
- Identifying priority gender concerns in reducing gender inequality and inequities.
- Indicating gender objectives in their action plans.
- Utilising gender disaggregated data from sector planning units.
- Setting gender monitoring indicators quantitative and qualitative.

More recently achievements catalogued by TGNP in 2006/07 as regards GRB in Tanzania include:

- At least 4 working sessions on gender budgeting with senior staff from the Ministry of Community Development, Gender and Children Development [23 staff], Ministry of Water [Directors and Heads of Training Departments], Ministry of Health and National Budgetary Guideline Team [to lobby for additional resources to social sectors].
- Pre-budget working sessions with the Parliamentary Committee on Community Development to focus on guidelines, and meetings with the Parliamentary Committees on Finance and Economics.
- TGNP also attributes the increase in water budget [e.g. from 3% to 6% of national budget], and health budgets [e.g., up to 15% of national budget], as a response to its advocacy campaigns.
- Planning sessions with selected actors on the development of clarity on certain sectoral issues and tools for mainstreaming.
- Monitoring and advocating for implementation of pro-poor and gender issues into policies, plans and budgets in 4 selected sectors - Water, Health, Community Development, and HIV/AIDS.
- Advocacy on increased budget allocation to maternal care, water, health, HIV/AIDS and community development through participation in the GBS, JAS, PER and working sessions.
- Advocating for free water and basic health services for pro-poor development with regional actors and networks.
- Facilitation of coalition based joint activities through lobbying and linking with FemAct members in the East African Budget Network Strategic Planning exercise.

Current Guidelines for the Preparation of Medium Term Plan and Budget Framework³ for 2005/06 to 2007/08 provide continued emphasis on addressing cross cutting issues. In its Chapter 5, dealing with policy commitments in the medium term, the guidelines urge gender and HIV/AIDS to be adhered to in agriculture

and the education sectors. Moreover, the guidelines instruct the following:

- Carrying out capacity building programmes for core personnel dealing with gender.
- Promoting credit facilities which cater for women economic development needs.
- Sensitising decision makers in gender matters at district and regional levels.
- Disseminating the National Gender Policy Framework and Strategy.
- Continuing to emphasise collection, analysis and use of gender disaggregated data by MDAs.
- Continuing the fight against gender violence and abuse.

In a recent report on the **Annual Consultative Meeting for the Public Expenditure Review's Medium Term Expenditure Framework Cluster-Wide Strategy** at White Sands Hotel, Dar Es Salaam, 13th May 2006, it is reaffirmed that the priority areas for resource allocation in the medium term include:

- Continued mainstreaming of gender into policies, plans and strategies at all levels.
- Capacity building for gender focal points.
- Promoting credit facilities for women and youths.
- Continued gender sensitisation at all levels.

On presenting the **National Economic Survey for the 2006 and Medium Term Outlook for 2007/08 to 2009/10**, the Minister for Planning, Economy and Empowerment, reiterated the governments' commitment on gender mainstreaming. In paragraph 87 of the speech, the minister acknowledges that *"during the year 2006, training was provided to gender focal persons from various ministries. In addition, frameworks for mainstreaming gender issues into various socio-economic policies were prepared"*. Moreover, the minister in paragraph 117 of the same speech, he makes further reference to need for additional efforts in mainstreaming gender in policies and plans for socio-economic development. All the above withstanding **challenges** abound for TGNP's

³ The President's Office, Planning and Privatization. 27th January 2005. Pages 27 to 36.

close engagement with the government. Among the main challenges are:

- Being too close to government circles is crucial for engaging or linking with government. But the challenge is at the same time to ensure protection of CSO transformation agenda while drawing lessons and building new skills.
- Capacity building at all levels has faced various obstacles, especially in regards to CSOs. It is hard to mobilize CSOs. Most have poor skills in linking gender to common daily activities, and this slows down the conceptualization process.
- Meeting expectations as a “Role Model”. Being too out-stretched in regards to its capacity, and facing a high demand for its services by its clients, there is obvious need for additional gender mainstreaming actors;
- North-South NGO partnership strengths. The North seemingly able to access information, and more able to influence the WB, IMF, WTO, bilateral donors. The Southern NGOs being comparatively more able to assess relevance of different ideas, strategies, and interventions. However, the common challenge is that governments and donors are frequently inconsistent.
- Challenging Macro-Economic Frameworks in HIPC conditionality, and limited room for government to support progressive approaches. Also the need for alternative development paradigms, and transformative strategies.
- Need for slightly more systematic identification and documentation of changes in regards to tracking what was caused by GBI or not?
- Absence of systematic mechanisms for tracking impact through using outreach groups for feedback, poor reporting on contentious issues.
- Being strange bed fellows as regards through being co-optioned by the government into negative policy outputs and outcomes.
- Constant need for shifting balance between strategic focus and content. Persistent complexity in balancing between TGNP’s wider goals and GBI’s regular demands. Whether to prioritise gender mainstreaming or economic advocacy, or whether to focus on neo-economic policy framework or the socio-economic development processes.

- Expenditure focused mobilization strategy. Current emphasis is narrowed towards diversified and hands-on strategies on expenditure tracking and monitoring at community level, everyday sectoral issues, focus on the poor and marginalized.

Additional challenges to GRB include the funding mechanisms in allocation of resources in Tanzania, especially the inadequate operation of the National Minimum Standards. More closely, this allocation criterion has revealed the following observations:

- Vertical and horizontal allocation of resources has failed to bring about efficient, equitable and transparent allocation of resources.
- Scant data on own sources at local government level, as well as excessive discretion by the Ministry of Finance, coupled with the apparent non-transparent mechanisms, also impede scrutiny.
- Local government agencies’ role in decentralization is still shrouded with ambiguity, and central government domination. Most local government agencies are more or less mere agents of central government, thus the presence of two budgets at local government agency levels.
- Financial management, accountability and transparency are largely below par. Even though fiscal devolution is systematically being pursued, the grant systems and health sector are still beset with centralization rigidity.
- Approaches to allocation of resources is highly conditional to size and distribution and is therefore determined in ad hoc fiscal fashion.

FUNDING MECHANISMS FOR NATIONAL MACHINERIES FOR THE ADVANCEMENT OF WOMEN

Ministry of Community Development, Gender and Children [MCDGC], is the main national machinery for advancement of women. On the Zanzibar side a similar ministry exists, that of Labour, Youth, and Women & Children Development. Both ministries are responsible for the gender focal point system that has been institutionalised in all MDAs. Gender Focal Points “assist in coordinating and monitoring mechanisms as well as in ensuring that all

sectoral policies and programmes are gender sensitive". Staff at the two ministries have been trained in gender analysis, gender planning and information communication technology. More significant perhaps is the fact that these ministries are responsible for monitoring and issuing progress reports on implementation of the BPPFA⁴.

Among the immediate results from activities engaged by the women machineries or ministries are inclusive of:

- Increased political representation of women from village and district councils [25 to 33%] to the parliament [from 23% to 30%].
- Increased number of women ministers [from 15% to 20%], deputy ministers [from 29% to 32%], permanent secretaries [from 30% to 32%], regional commissioners [from 10% to 14%], and elected counsellors [from 10% to 35%].
- Preparation of gender issues sectoral mainstreaming guidelines for gender focal points on how to advise, implement, and monitor gender issues in Zanzibar.
- Gender mainstreaming training for senior government officers from ministries of education, health, labour, and the office of the chief government statistician in Zanzibar.
- Gender sensitisation of nearly all Permanent Secretaries and RAS in both Zanzibar and Mainland Tanzania.

Evidence on funding to the women machineries as compared to other ministries shows a generally unfavourable picture. For the present budget year, the ministry has been allocated 10.4 Billion shillings [or 0.00214% of the total budget] as compared to 10.9 Billion shillings in the previous year [or 0.00179% of the total budget]. This is a dismal figure by all measures! This budget is expected to be used only in the ministry and does not stretch to facilitate resource requirements for gender mainstreaming at the district level. Funding for gender mainstreaming in other MDAs is supposed to be obtained from within the respective organisation. While HIV/AIDS is

readily allocated funds for interventions in all MDAs, the same cannot be claimed for gender.

Donor funding to the ministry of gender in the current fiscal year, originates mainly from the following sources: UNICEF - for basic education and life skills programme, child survival and development programme, policy advocacy and analysis programme, and child protection and participation programmes; the World Bank - for HIV/AIDS, and UNFPA - for Advocacy and Gender Development programme.

As a matter of fact the government has for the past decade made annual disbursements to all districts through its Women Development Fund [WDF], wherein each district receives an average 8 million shillings (approximately USD \$ 6400) annually⁵. This is a miniscule amount in any serious measure. Otherwise more significant credit facilities for women empowerment objectives are accessed through micro-credit organisations such as PRIDE (T), CRDB Bank's Micro-Credit Department, and numerous SACCOS - Savings & Credit Cooperative Societies; SACAS - Savings & Credit Associations; SGs - Solidarity Groups; ROSCAs - Rotating Savings & Credit Associations.

ROLE WOMEN ORGANISATIONS PLAY IN THE GENDER RESPONSIVE BUDGETING PROCESS

TGNP has continued to organise consultative discussions and meetings with more than 30 FemAct members. This involves updating the GBI strategy and continued facilitation of responsive and coalition joint activities. Through its Sub-Programme 2 on Activism, Lobbying and Coalition Building, TGNP has continued to organise and promote advocacy work around gender budgeting, HIV/AIDS, GBV, anti-water privatisation, and post election violence. Some of the actors involved in the joint advocacy interventions through the FemAct coalition are:

- Tanzania Media Women Association [TAMWA] who plays a very active advocacy role in eliminating violence against women [GBV].

⁴ Country Report on Implementation of the Beijing Platform for Action and the Outcome Document of the Twenty Third Session of the General Assembly - Beijing +10. United Republic of Tanzania. 2005.

⁵ Budget Speech 2006/07. Ministry of Community Development, Gender & Children.

- NGO's involved in promoting and protecting human rights are also involved in addressing issues of combating violence against women - Women in Law and Development in Africa [WLAC], and the Legal and Human Right Centre [LHRC].
- IGNs and Outreach Groups in Mbeya Rural, Kyela District, Kisarawe District, and Kinondoni District.

CRITERIA USED FOR DEFINING AN EFFECTIVE GRB PROCESS

Criteria for defining an effective GRB process is partially given through definition issued by TGNP, and partially through the guidelines issued by the Planning Commission. On the TGNP side⁶, a gender sensitive pro-poor budget is defined as a budget that is characterised by the following factors:

- Seeks to *“actively target resources and services to improve the quality of life for the most marginalised women, men and youth.”*
- Attempts to *“cushion people especially poor men and women against social adversity.”*
- Takes *“a wider view of poverty by noting that it is more than lack of income.”*
- Focuses on *“increasing income as well as improving access to other resources.”*

On the government side, the criteria for defining an effective GRB process is normally set out by the Planning Commission through its annual planning guidelines.

MEASURING PROGRESS AND IMPACT FOR GRB

Several GRB research exercises and documents that aimed at measuring progress and impact of GRB interventions have been engaged in the past years both from within and outside the country⁷. Nevertheless, progress has so far been

measured through some of the hereunder listed methods:

- Working sessions on Budget Tracking with selected IGNs and outreach groups. Mbeya IGN organised 3 sessions looking at the budgetary process (public expenditure tracking (PET) with gender responsiveness⁸), in two districts - Kyela and Mbeya Rural. Kinondoni and Kisarawe IGNs followed up on feedback regarding initiatives to track budgetary allocation at district level.
- Organisation of budget analysis sessions on the 2007/08 budget session. Two GDSS sessions were held with more than 259 participants - 176 being women.
- Organisation of joint advocacy and lobbying activities with more than 650 FemAct members and partners on matters such as - GBV and maternal mortality; Beijing +10; Time Use issues; Water, International Women's Day, and HIV/AIDS]. Deputy Minister for Community Development and the Minister for Constitutional Affairs attended some of these sessions.
- Organisation of feedback sessions on findings of Time Use Survey. This focused on cleaning the data and strengthening analytical skills on the concept of care economy.

Nevertheless measuring progress has been difficult to say the least. Irrespective of the numerous efforts and apparent mainstreaming actions in some key sectors TGNP and its partners have continuously encountered the hereunder gaps in maintaining progress and impact during the implementation of the first and second phases of the GRB:

- How to ensure continued accountability by MPs on the civil society agenda. Most MPs agree on supporting the CSO agenda when approached individually, but only to default once they are in the full sessions.
- How to use outreach groups for feedback. Modalities are yet to be developed and refined as to how to engage effective coordination of documenting and sharing reports on changes.

⁶ TGNP. Post Budget Review 2004/05. Cross Cutting Issues: Poverty, Gender and HIV/AIDS. June 2004. Page 3.

⁷ GBI Final Report; July 1997-April 2000. TGNP.

⁸ Fraud involving misuse of funds for primary education was discovered

- How to follow-up in order to support use of mainstreaming guidelines. Mechanisms for mainstreaming gender in resource management are yet to be institutionalized in most MDAs. The main challenge here is thus how to ensure that all pilot sectors apply the GBI guidelines as required.
- How to develop new or better ways of backstopping the government and other actors. There are inadequate human resources for spreading around. Thus demand goes unmet.
- How to support local initiatives. Even if some actors at the IGN level try to engage their own efforts in mainstreaming gender, and especially at the local communities' level, it is not easy to support these efforts at will.
- How to provide material support to IGNs. TGNP is yet to find practical modalities on how to provide more material support as requested by IGNs.

INNOVATIVE APPROACHES FOR FINANCING GENDER EQUALITY AND WOMEN EMPOWERMENT

Overall it is not easy to identify innovative approaches for financing gender equality, but instead look for general or specific examples for financing gender equality and women's empowerment. A few such examples found in the education sector include:

- **Girls Secondary Education Support Programme (GSES)** has been established by the Ministry of Education & Vocational Training in order to support more than 2980 girls benefited between 1998 and 2002⁹. This financial support programme aims at increasing enrolment of girls from poorer households in both lower and upper secondary schools thus improving their performance and completion rates. It, therefore, increases chances for financially incapable bright girls to have a chance to enter and complete secondary education. The strategy applied in this programme
- **Female Undergraduate Scholarship Program.** The programme enhances the capacity of the University of Dar Es Salaam

in promoting gender mainstreaming through improved education of women by sponsoring female students at the University of Dar Es Salaam, to mitigate the burden of cost sharing. In the year 2006/2007 a total of 6,027 new undergraduate and graduate students got admittance at the University of Dar Es Salaam. Among the 3,890 undergraduate students 1,400 were girls [36%], while of the 2,137 post graduate students, 577 are girls [27%].¹⁰

- University of Dar Es Salaam¹¹ has also created a special **Pre-Entry University Programmes** to promote more girls into joining courses in science, engineering, technology, economics and statistics. This is a deliberate intervention to ensure gender equity between girls and boys at University level.
- **Complementary Basic Education in Tanzania (COBET).** The programme has been incorporated into the **Primary Education Development Programme** whereby a good number of girls who dropped from formal primary education join COBET classes.
- The Government has taken measures to increase enrolment by **making the school environment more attractive to girls.** Such measures include increasing the number of female teachers, financial and institutional support to improve academic performance.
- Provision of **boarding facilities for girls** and reforming curricula textbooks to make them more gender sensitive, and in collaboration with NGOs campaigns to change attitudes in favour of girls' education¹².

¹⁰ Budget Speech: Ministry of Science, Technology and Higher Education, 2007/2008

¹¹ **Sokoine University of Agriculture.** Out of 1,089 undergraduate students admitted in this university in 2006/2007, 33% or 820 students are females. As compared to 30% or 269 of post graduate students.

Mzumbe University. In 2006/2007, the university admitted 816 students, of whom 44% or 358 are female. In addition, the university also admitted 282 post graduate students, 47% or 133 being female.

Muhimbili University College of Health Sciences. This university admitted 331 students in the academic year 2006/2007, 31% or 101 being female.

⁹ Country Report on Implementation of the Beijing Platform of Action

¹² Country Report on Implementation of the Beijing Platform of Action (Beijing +5) 2000.

- Other innovative approaches include the recent provision of credit facilities by the government for small and medium entrepreneurs [with special focus on women], at the regional level through the National Micro-Finance and the CRDB banks. More than 20 billion shillings were provided by the government in the 2007/08 fiscal year, with an additional 10 billion for the 2008/09 fiscal year.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE ACTION

Assuming that the GBI exercise is a long term gender transformation strategy with immediate and sometimes short term goals, it is anticipated its presence will be indefinite. As of present, actors within the Tanzanian scenario need to concentrate their efforts in the following areas:

- Standardization and popularization of tools used in gender disaggregated beneficiary assessment of service delivery and budget priorities in the piloted MDA Ministries.
 - Annual follow-up and scrutiny of gender aware medium term macroeconomic policy framework through the PER and TAS forums.
 - Yearly review of gender aware policy evaluation of public expenditures with the Ministry of Finance through the Ministry's programme performance budgeting system.
 - Regularized scrutiny of gender aware budget statements, especially in: women's priority public services such as health; gender inequality reduction ratios within education, policy making and legislation.
 - Additional research on gender disaggregated public expenditure benefit incidence analysis at the local government level within TGNP's IGN networks Districts.
 - Producing an annual report on achievements and technical progress in gender budgeting interventions in collaboration with the Ministry of Finance and or Planning Commission.
 - Inserting gender budgeting as a component in capacity or skills building courses, seminars or workshops at Finance institutions such as the IFM and Business College), planning institutions (Institute of Development Planning and Institute of Rural Development Planning), and for donor funded activities within Tanzania making it part of the agenda in evaluations, assessments and reviews.
- Providing feedback on GBI findings in the researched sectors to reach at least 30% of all MPs, and key government staff or partners.
 - Documentation and popularisation of GBI research findings to reach at least 30% of key actors in the researched sectors.
 - Identifying new areas or sectors for GBI research at the local government levels and other ministries.
 - Conducting training on gender policy and issues of macro-economics to selected FemAct, IGNs and selected community service organisations through training sessions arranged quarterly.
 - Organizing GBI training to selected actors in the Ministry of Finance, especially the Revenue section through reaching at least 15 planners and or budget officers.
 - Conducting regular working sessions with the National Guideline Team at the Planning Commission to backstop the engendering of the budget guidelines.
 - Focusing on demand for public services - whether health, water and other services are geared towards eliminating care and other burdens, free drugs - ARVs, removal of health fees.
 - Engaging GBI interventions at national, district and local levels by focusing on health, water, governance, and partner local government districts - IGN linked.
 - Continued collective engagement for collective responses on electoral system and number of women in political and public leadership.

REFERENCES & SOURCE MATERIALS

- Balmori, Helena Hofbauer., **Gender and Budgets. Overview Report. BRIDGE. Development – Gender. February 2003.**
- Mascarenhas, Ophelia., **“Gender Profile of Tanzania: Enhancing Gender equality”.** TGNP & SIDA. TGNP 2007.
- Mhina, Edward H., **“Budgeting in the Education Sector”** TGNP Research Report. May 1998.
- Mhina, Edward H., **“Tanzanian Experiences on NGO and Government Research Partnership” Conference Paper on Participatory Action Research on Gender Budgeting.** Paper presented at the South-North Experience Conference, University of London, and 28th June - 1st July 1999.
- Meena, Ruth., et.al. (editor) **“Gender Budget Initiative: Agriculture Sector Study”** TGNP, September 1999.
- Price, Waterhouse & Coopers:2006.1 **Budget 2006. Looking Ahead. Commentary.**
- TGNP:1998.1 **Gender Budget Initiative.** December 1998.
- TGNP:1999.1 **1999 Annual Report.**
- TGNP:1999:2 **Budgeting with a Gender Focus.**
- TGNP:1999:3 **GBI: Agricultural Sector Study.**
- TGNP: 1999:4 **GBI: Research Report from Mbeya Rural District.** By Rehema Mwateba and Babette Pfander
- TGNP: 2000.1 **“A Detailed Three Year (2000-2002) Planning Document”.**
- TGNP: 2000.2 **2000 Annual Plan.**
- TGNP: 2000.3 **Checklist for Mainstreaming Gender into the Government Budget. Prepared for the**
- Ministry of Finance, Tanzania.** TGNP, September 2000.
- TGNP:2000.4 **Report on Short Term Consultancy on Gender Mainstreaming in the Budget System. Submitted by Debbie Budlender.** May 2000.
- TGNP:2000.5 **Consultancy report on Activities Facilitated by the TGNP on Gender Mainstreaming the National Budgets.** 10th May 2000. Prepared by Mary Rusimbi and Gemma Akilimali.
- TGNP:2006.1 **Annual Report for Year 2005. January to December 2005.** January 2006.
- TGNP:2003.1 **5 Year Plan of Action (2003-2007).**
- TGNP:2004.1 **Cross Cutting Issues: Poverty, Gender & HIV/AIDS. Post Budget Review 2004/05.** June 2004.
- TGNP:2006.1 **Annual Report for Year 2005. January to December 2005.** January 2006.
- TGNP:2006.2 **Report on African Gender and Development Index (AGDI) – The Tanzania Report.** February 2005.
- TGNP:2005.2 **A Case Study on Strategies for Transforming and Mainstreaming Gender into National Guidelines and budgeting Processes & Macro-Economic Policies in Tanzania. The Case of Gender Budget Initiative (GBI).** undated.
- TGNP:2005.1 **Is This a Pro-Poor Gender Sensitive Budget? Economic, Employment and Incomes Issues.** undated.
- TGNP:2002.2 **A Report on Training Workshop for Selected Policy and Planning Officers on Gender and Macro-Economics Models.** 26th to 27th September 2002. Mabibo Gender Resource Center. 2002.
- TGNP:2003.3 **A Pro-Poor and Gender Analysis of Tanzania’s National Budget.** 20th August 2003.
- ESRF:2006.1 **Post Budget Discussion Forum. Is the 2006/2007 Budget Pro-Poor and Gender Sensitive? Time for a New Alternative Budget Framework.** 22nd June 2006.
- International Budget Project:2000.1 **A Taste of Success – Examples of the Budget Work of NGOs. Affecting Macro-Economic Policy and Processes. The Gender Budget Initiative, Tanzania.** October 2000.
- TGNP:2006.1 **Annual Report for Year 2005. January to December 2005.** January 2006.
- URT: 1999.2 **Speech by the Minister of State President’s Office (Planning).** Presenting to The

National Assembly the Economic Survey for 1998 and Rolling Plan and Forward Budget for 1999/2000 - 2001/2002 on 10th June, 1999.Planning Commission.

URT: 2000.1 **Guidelines for the Preparation of the Medium Term Plan and Expenditure Framework, 1999/2000 - 2001/2002.** The President's Office (Planning Commission).

URT: 2000.2 **Guidelines for the Preparation of the Medium Term Plan and Expenditure Framework, 2000/01 - 2002/03.** The President's Office (Planning Commission).

UNICEF. **Gender Achievements and Prospects in Education: The Gap Report, Part One.** November 2005.

ECA: **Compendium of Best Practices on Gender Mainstreaming: Engendering National Budgets: The Case of Tanzania.** ECA, 2002.

URT. **Budget Speech: Ministry of Science, Technology and Higher Education 2007/2008**

URT. **Country Report on Implementation of the Beijing Platform for Action and the Outcome Document of the 23rd Special Session of the General Assembly - Beijing +10, 2005.**

Mobile: +255-0744/0754-340488 [Cellular]

Fax: +255-22-2121631

Email: ehmhina@netscape.net

CONTACTS

For any further clarifications or explanations on this or any matter, please contact the addresses below:

Chief Consultant

GAD Consult

Gender and Development Consultants

P.O.Box 4361, Dar Es Salaam.

Physical Address: AlyKhan Road 82, Upanga East.

Tel: +255-022-2121631

Email: gadconsult@msn.com

WEB: www.gadconsult.org

Or

Tel: +255-22-2121631 [Office]

Tel: +255-22-2771828 [Home]